

## SCHOLASTIC BOWL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

The IHSA Scholastic Bowl Advisory Committee met virtually on Wednesday, May 5, 2021, beginning at 10:00 a.m. Committee Members present were: Jim Campbell, Coach, Port Byron (Riverdale); Scott Froelich, Coach, Normal (Community); Matt Hasquin, Coach, Piasa (Southwestern); Rob Grierson, Coordinator of Officials, Skokie. Others in attendance: Brad Fischer, Head Question Editor, Kraig Garber, IHSA Assistant Executive Director.

### TERMS AND CONDITIONS RECOMMENDATIONS:

#### 1. Rule 4-H-1k & l

**Recommendation:** Amend Rule 4-H-1k and 4-H-1l to state the following:

- 4-H-1k. Answering, Completeness, or timing error on the part of the moderator or timekeeper that results in the first team's ~~potentially~~ correct answer being ruled incorrect.  
Remedy: Rule the first team's answer correct and adjust the score to award points to the first team and deduct from the second team if they were awarded points in error.
- 4-H-1l. Answering, Completeness, or timing error on the part of the moderator or timekeeper that results in the second team's ~~potentially~~ correct answer being ruled incorrect.  
Remedy: Rule the second team's answer correct, award points as appropriate, and proceed with the match.

**Rationale:** Appropriate application of these two Rules hinges on an interpretation of the phrase "potentially correct." If the answer that has been ruled incorrect is "potentially correct" because it is discovered that it was indeed an alternative correct answer, then these Rules, and their remedies, apply. If the answer that has been ruled incorrect is "potentially correct" because it could be argued that, had the moderator prompted, the player might possibly have come up with the correct answer, these Rules, and their remedies, do not apply. Therefore, removing the word "potentially" from the rules removes any ambiguity.

Approved by Consent

#### 2. Add Rules to 4-H-1

**Recommendation:** Add new rules 4-H-1m and 4-H-1n to state the following:

- 4-H-1m Answering, Completeness, or timing error on the part of the moderator or timekeeper that results in the first team's promptable answer being ruled incorrect.  
Remedy: Discard and replace the question and read it for both teams.
- 4-H-1n Answering, Completeness, or timing error on the part of the moderator or timekeeper that results in the second team's promptable answer being ruled incorrect.  
Remedy: Discard and replace the question. If it is a tossup, read the replacement tossup only for the second team and, if answered correctly, read a bonus as usual for both teams. If it is a bonus, read the replacement bonus for both teams.

**Rationale:** As a result of amending 4-H-1k and 4-H-1l, the addition of 4-H-1m and 4-H-1n is necessary to further clarify the circumstances of 4-H-1k or 4-H-1l, but with the twist that the moderator failed to prompt the first or second team.

Approved by Consent

#### 3. Adjust/Add to the Casebook

**Recommendation:** Make the following adjustments/additions to the case book regarding changes to Rule 4-H-1:

**4-H-1k and 4-H-1l**

#### **4-H-1k, 4-H-1l, 4-H-1m, and 4-H-1n**

~~If the answer that has been ruled incorrect is “potentially correct” because it is discovered that it was indeed an alternative correct answer, then these Rules, and their remedies, apply. If the answer that has been ruled incorrect is “potentially correct” because it could be argued that, had the moderator prompted, the player might possibly have come up with the correct answer, these Rules, and their remedies, do not apply—the more appropriate remedies are those in Rules 4-H-1e and 4-H-1d if the situation arises on a toss-up question, or Rules 4-H-1g and 4-H-1h if the situation arises on a bonus part .-These rules concern issues that arise when a player is ruled incorrect inappropriately. Rules 1k and 1l apply when the player's answer was correct as given, and Rules 1m and 1n apply when the player's answer was not yet fully correct, but worthy of a prompt.~~ The following Cases are for toss-up questions; similar reasoning should be applied for bonus questions.

#### **~~4-H-1k: CASE #1:~~**

*The following tossup question is asked:*

*Name the author of The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn.*

*The printed answer is "Mark Twain."*

*Player #1 on Team X rings in and answers "Samuel Clemens."*

*The moderator rules: "Incorrect."*

*Team Y rings in (or not); if an answer is given, it is ruled correct or incorrect; in any case, the printed answer is revealed.*

*Team X appeals.*

Samuel Clemens is acceptable under Rule 4-B-11; apply the remedy for Rule 4-H-1k: Adjust the score appropriately.

#### **~~4-H-1l: CASE #1:~~**

*The following tossup question is asked:*

*Name the author of The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn.*

*The printed answer is "Mark Twain."*

*Player #1 on Team X rings in and answers "Charles Dickens."*

*The moderator rules: "Incorrect."*

*Player #1 on Team Y rings in and answers "Samuel Clemens."*

*The moderator rules: "Incorrect" – and reveals the printed answer.*

*Team Y appeals.*

Samuel Clemens is acceptable under Rule 4-B-11; apply the remedy for Rule 4-H-1l: Adjust the score appropriately.

#### **~~4-H-1k: CASE #2:~~**

#### **4-H-1m**

*The following tossup question is asked:*

*Name the sixth President of the United States.*

*The printed answer is "John Quincy Adams", with "Quincy" and "Adams" underlined as required information.*

*Player #1 on Team X rings in, and answers "Adams."*

*The moderator rules "Incorrect."*

*Team Y rings in (or not); if an answer is given it is ruled correct or incorrect; in any case, the printed answer is revealed.*

*Team X appeals.*

Clearly, Team X should have been prompted, so Rule ~~4-H-1k~~ does not apply 4-H-1m applies. We do not know whether the prompt would have elicited the correct answer; furthermore, the printed answer will have been revealed during or after Team Y's attempt. ~~Instead, apply the remedy for Rule 4-H-1e:~~ Discard and replace the toss-up and read it for both teams.

#### **4-H-1l: CASE #2:**

##### **4-H-1n**

*The following tossup question is asked:*

*Name the sixth President of the United States.*

*The printed answer is "John Quincy Adams", with "Quincy" and "Adams" underlined as required information.*

*Player #1 on Team X rings in, and answers "Monroe."*

*The moderator rules "Incorrect."*

*Player #1 on Team Y rings in and answers "Adams."*

*The moderator rules: "Incorrect" – and reveals the printed answer.*

*Team Y appeals.*

Clearly, Team Y should have been prompted, so Rule ~~4-H-1l~~ does not apply 4-H-1n applies. We do not know whether the prompt would have elicited the correct answer, and once the moderator has ~~ruled the answer incorrect, prompting is inappropriate.~~ revealed the printed answer, prompting is impossible. Instead, apply the remedy for Rule 4-H-1d: Read a replacement toss-up for the second team only. Discard and replace the tossup. Because Team X has already been ruled incorrect on the original tossup, the replacement tossup is read only for Team Y. If Team Y answers the replacement tossup correctly, the bonus proceeds normally, with Team X eligible to answer rebounded parts.

**Rationale:** With the adjustments/additions to Rule 4-H-1, the case book also needs updated to correctly reflect the rule book.

Approved by Consent

#### **Administrative Recommendations:**

1. **Question Source:** The committee supports the recommendation to allow Brad Fischer to continue to serve as the Head Editor for the IHSA State Series Questions for the 2021-22 school year. The committee is aware of the potential conflict of interest that arises because Brad's wife is the coach of a team that participates in the State Series. Brad will provide a written assurance that he will keep the questions confidential, and the committee feels that bringing the potential conflict to light serves to further ensure that no infractions occur.

Approved by Consent

#### **Other items of discussion that did not receive action:**

1. There was a discussion about exploring the idea of adding powers to the point structure.
2. There was a discussion about adjusting the question balance for the state series, particularly, the number of math toss-up/bonus questions.