

Minutes of the 2015-16 Journalism Advisory Committee

Thursday May 5, 2016

The IHSA Journalism Advisory Committee was held at the IHSA Office in Bloomington on Thursday, May 5, 2016 beginning at 10:00 a.m. Liaisons present were: Homewood-Flossmoor Sectional manager Gail Smith. Advisory committee members: Division 1-John Gonczy, Chicago (Marist), Adviser; Division 2- Chauncey Carrick, Sycamore, Activities Director; Division 3- Keith Carlson, Naperville (Central), Adviser; Division 4-Dan Kerns, Peoria (Richwoods); Division 5-Tim Lee, Fithian (Oakwood), Principal; Division 6 – Michael Gudwien, Williamsville, Adviser; Division 7- Dana Donovan, Okawville, Adviser; and Division 6 – Jennifer Reiser, Washington, Adviser. IHSA Asst. Executive Director Matt Troha conducted the meeting.

TERMS AND CONDITIONS RECOMMENDATIONS

1. VIII. Tournament Rules
C. Special Rules and Limitations
6. Equipment

Recommendation: Erase final sentence: "Recording devices are..."

Rationale: New Recording device section recommended below

2. VIII. Tournament Rules
C. Special Rules and Limitations
7. Create New 7.

Recommendation: Create new 7. To read:

7. Recording Devices: Any device with the ability to record is permitted, however, the internet capabilities on the device must be disabled per rule VIII-C-8.

If approved, this change would create New 7., moving current 7. *Online Access* to 8.

Rationale: Clarifies what devices are allowable for recording, the protocol for recording devices with internet capabilities and makes information easier to find.

3. VIII. Tournament Rules
C. Special Rules and Limitations
7. Online Access

Recommendation: Erase text that reads "unless directed by the contest prompt". End sentence with period and add new sentence to read: "Violation of this rule will result in a disqualification."

Rationale: There are no instances currently where prompts would direct competitors to use internet access. If Proposal #2 is approved, allowing internet capable devices as recorders, it becomes more important to stress the penalty for using the internet on one of these devices.

4. VIII. Tournament Rules

C. Special Rules and Limitations

VIII-4. & 8. & 10. & 11. & 13. & 16. & 17. & aside language after 17 & C-6

Recommendation: In each instance where the phrase “Students are permitted to use an AP Stylebook and dictionaries.” Add in parenthesis at the end of each instance the following language: “(non-electronic format only).”

Rationale: With more schools using online or app versions of these items, this helps create consistency that these versions are prohibited per the contest rules.

5. XI. Judging

B. Duties of Judges

1. & 2. & 4. & create new #5

Recommendation: Make the following changes to the sub-sections of B. Duties of Judges:

1. Change “collectively” to “independently”.

2. Change first line to “Judges shall **not** confer with **anyone** other than tourney officials.

4. Add language that reads: “Ranks will be tabulated by the contest manager or an individual designated by the contest manager”.

4. Eliminate “there will be no ties”

new 5. There will be no ties, thus, judges will be asked to confer to break ties to determine the final place orders.”

Rationale: These changes move the judging system from two judges jointly creating a singular rank in each event, to two judges judging each entry individually, and then conferring only if ties exist. This process does not allow one judges’ opinion or personality to sway the results and provides students more assessment and feedback.

6. VIII. Tournament Rules

A. Categories

2. Broadcast News

Recommendation: Add following language to the category description: “The students MP3 file must be transferred to a blank flash drive provided by the competitor and submitted for judging.”

Rationale: This information is stated in the prompt annually, but should appear in the Terms & Conditions.

7. VIII. Tournament Rules

A. Categories

1. Photo Story Telling

Recommendation: Add following language to the category description: “No previous pictures are allowed on the memory card.”

Rationale: This information is stated in the prompt annually, but should appear in the Terms & Conditions.

- 8. VIII. Tournament Rules
 - A. Categories
 - 10. Copy Editing

Recommendation: Add following language to the category description: “All marks must be made in pencil.”

Rationale: Judges have asked for this change to make judging easier, as well as for student/adviser to be able to tell more clearly which marks have been made by the student and by the judge.

- 9. VIII. Tournament Rules
 - A. Categories
 - 8. Yearbook Caption Writing

Recommendation: Replace following language into category description:

Old: “and must fit within a caption...”

New: “and must fit within a provided caption box that meets the prompts requirements for text size, font and spacing.”

Rationale: Confirms that the category will be held on a computer with a provided text box, and that the prompt will provide the font and text size, which cannot be changed.

- 10. III. On-Line Entries Withdrawal Procedures...
 - E. Online List of Participants

Recommendation: Add language that reads: The IHSA will provide advisers notice of a five-day window approximately three weeks before the Sectional where they can access the List of Participants to make changes.

Rationale: The initial deadline is important for getting ballpark numbers to help evenly distribute schools to their Sectional sites. However, many substitutions occur closer to the Sectional date, and allowing the schools access again would allow them to provide up-to-date info and take this burden off the Sectional hosts.

Item added after Oct. 4 conference call

- 11. VI. Tournament Structure and Time Schedules – D. Time Schedule

Recommendation: Change Time Schedule to read:

8:00 AM to 9:00 AM	Registration
9:30 AM to 11:00 AM	Block A
11:30 AM to 1:00 PM	Block B
3:00 PM	Awards

Rationale: By moving Block A forward, the schedule allows more time for judging in each block. It also allows time for students competing in both blocks to eat lunch, while keeping awards on schedule.

ADMINISTRATIVE RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Changes to Judges Sheets

Recommendation: Lines on each Standard of Excellence checklist will be eliminated and more space for feedback on each item provided. Sheets will also be adjusted for singular judge signature if other proposal passes.

Rationale: The lines next to the checklist creates the appearance of the need for a ranking provided for each Standard, when that was not the intent, but rather a guideline to accompany the subjective judging process, which often creates confusion among advisers and competitors.

2. Change to Yearbook Caption Writing Judges Sheet

Recommendation: Add Standard of Excellence that reads: "Does caption conform to caption box size, text size, and font requested in the prompt?"

Rationale: If this language is added to the T&Cs and prompt per the previous proposals, then it is imperative that it be judged as well.

3. Changes to prompts

Recommendation: The following will be changed on all applicable prompts:

- a) Add Terms & Conditions description of each event to each event prompt.
- b) Clarify in upper righthand box that students should write only school code and not the school name, name or anything else.
- c) Add disclaimer to prompts in events that can potentially have live press conferences, that students should use information provided in press conference, and not change it to reflect the fake prompt town/school.

Rationale: These changes will make expectations clearer for competitors.

4. Prompt Policy

Recommendation: The IHSA will make the Sectional prompts available each year at the conclusion of the State Final tournament. The IHSA will attempt to update the Sectional prompts based on changes made by the advisory committee that year prior to posting.

Rationale: This provides updated information for schools to use to practice and prepare for the State Series, while also providing the State Finals to be available to be edited and reused in upcoming years.

Item added after Oct. 4 conference call

5. Judges

Recommendation: In the week following the 2017 State Final Tournament, the IHSA will invite two judges (who did not judge the state finals) to the IHSA office, where they will each independently judge two categories from the finals. They will compare their independent results and then work together to reach a consensus on a Top 6 ranking in each category.

Rationale: Judges currently judge as a team. This exercise would serve as a pilot to see if the Journalism Advisory Committee should consider changing to an independent two-person judging system. The

results of the pilot and feedback from participating judges would be shared with the committee for consideration.

ITEMS OF DISCUSSION:

1. The committee welcomed new committee members Chauncey Carrick, John Gonczy, and Dan Kerns.
2. The committee heard reports from Gail Fisher and Keith Carlson on the respective Sectionals they hosted at Homewood-Flossmoor and Naperville Central. Committee members then reported on the respective Sectionals they attended.
3. The committee reviewed template language for new Proctor Instruction sheets and Judging Instruction sheets that will be implemented next year. The committee agreed that a standard script would help proctors and competing students alike, while the judging sheets will help offer consistency from site to site.
4. The committee asked Matt to send out a survey to advisers to gauge interest in adding a video category.
5. The committee discussed a send-in video category proposal from Eastern Illinois University and whether it would be a better fit for the IHSA or IJEA contests.
6. The committee discussed computer software used in the State Series. Because so many schools use different programs, they agreed that it would be impossible to reach a consensus on software and believe that using InDesign/Adobe Creative Suites continues to be the best avenue for the tournament.
7. Committee members reporting seeing advisers helping Photo Story Telling competitors during Sectionals to determine photos, which is prohibited per the Terms & Conditions.
8. The committee discussed communication leading up to Sectionals. The committee agreed that when the IHSA alerts advisers of the window to review and update their LOP, they will also provide a reminder to review T&Cs and provide some FAQs.
9. The committee discussed the idea of a “games committee” that are used in other IHSA sports and activities to help make rule violation rulings.
10. The committee discussed the inclusion of a signature button that each adviser must hit verifying they have read the Terms & Conditions prior to being able to submit their LOP or an annual rules video.
11. The committee discussed a need to more stringently enforce the rules of the Terms & Conditions, and a general onus for advisers to better prepare their students for the rules of the State Series prior to competition.
12. The committee discussed using a word count in the Yearbook Caption Writing category.
13. The committee discussed the first year of Photo Story Telling (previously Feature Photography). Committee members noted there was little feedback on the changes at their Sectionals.
14. The committee discussed providing letter labels for the student work to avoid poor writing of school codes being misread.

15. The committee asked Matt to investigate if there are other awards venue options at Eastern Illinois University that would better accommodate the crowd.

16. The committee discussed more yearbook events in the future. The group felt like the contest is reaching a point where further event expansion may not be able to occur without subtracting other current events. With video categories being discussed, the committee felt it was not the time to seriously consider adding more events.

17. The committee discussed the content of the live press conferences at each Sectional.

18. The committee discussed the current page setup for Headline Writing and would like for it to look more like a standard page.

19. The committee discussed if the wording of the Judging Sheet Standards of Excellence should be changed from its current question format. The group agreed that given the proposed changes for this year to the judging, they would take a wait and see approach.

20. The committee recognized outgoing committee members Keith Carlson, Michael Gudwien, and Dana Donovan.